

A Service of



Leibniz-Informationszentrum Wirtschaft Leibniz Information Centre

Kettner, Claudia; Köppl, Angela; Stagl, Sigrid

Working Paper
List of well-being indicators

WWWforEurope Working Paper, No. 2

Provided in Cooperation with:

WWWforEurope - WelfareWealthWork, Wien

Suggested Citation: Kettner, Claudia; Köppl, Angela; Stagl, Sigrid (2012): List of well-being indicators, WWWforEurope Working Paper, No. 2, WWWforEurope, Vienna

This Version is available at: https://hdl.handle.net/10419/125657

Standard-Nutzungsbedingungen:

Die Dokumente auf EconStor dürfen zu eigenen wissenschaftlichen Zwecken und zum Privatgebrauch gespeichert und kopiert werden.

Sie dürfen die Dokumente nicht für öffentliche oder kommerzielle Zwecke vervielfältigen, öffentlich ausstellen, öffentlich zugänglich machen, vertreiben oder anderweitig nutzen.

Sofern die Verfasser die Dokumente unter Open-Content-Lizenzen (insbesondere CC-Lizenzen) zur Verfügung gestellt haben sollten, gelten abweichend von diesen Nutzungsbedingungen die in der dort genannten Lizenz gewährten Nutzungsrechte.

Terms of use:

Documents in EconStor may be saved and copied for your personal and scholarly purposes.

You are not to copy documents for public or commercial purposes, to exhibit the documents publicly, to make them publicly available on the internet, or to distribute or otherwise use the documents in public.

If the documents have been made available under an Open Content Licence (especially Creative Commons Licences), you may exercise further usage rights as specified in the indicated licence.





List of well-being indicators

Working Paper no 2

Authors: Claudia Kettner (WIFO), Angela Köppl (WIFO), Sigrid Stagl (WU)

December 2012



Authors: Claudia Kettner (WIFO), Angela Köppl (WIFO), Sigrid Stagl (WU) **Contributions by**: Kurt Kratena (WIFO), Jeroen van den Bergh (UAB)

Reviewed by: John Gowdy (Rensselaer Polytechnic Institute)

List of well-being indicators

Work Package 202

Milestone 30 "List of well-being indicators suitable for inclusion in socio-ecologically extended macroeconomic models"

Working Paper no 2

This document can be downloaded from www.foreurope.eu
Please respect that this report was produced by the named authors within the WWWforEurope project and has to be cited accordingly





THEME SSH.2011.1.2-1

Socio-economic Sciences and Humanities Europe moving towards a new path of economic growth and social development - Collaborative project



List of well-being indicators

Claudia Kettner (WIFO), Angela Köppl (WIFO), Sigrid Stagl (WU)

Abstract

This milestone presents a pool of available indicators and indicator systems which go beyond the narrow concepts of national economic accounts as well as a structuring of the indicators and indices according to central areas of well-being. The milestone builds the basis for Task 202.2, where a subset of indicators will be selected based on different theoretical frameworks, e.g. services / functionings, needs. Some of the indicators will be included in the macro-economic models in order to account for key dimensions of sustainability.

Contribution to the Project

The list aims to identify a set of well-being indicators suitable for inclusion in macroeconomic models and useful for policy advice.

The concept of sustainable development goes beyond well-being, but is related to it. Due to the multidimensionality of both concepts they show a high complexity. Sets of indicators are considered an appropriate tool to reduce this complexity and to account for the interaction between society, economy and the biophysical environment. Systems of indicators for sustainable development were developed by a number of international institutions including the EU and the UN.

On the basis of our assessment carried out in task 202.1, WU, WIFO and UAB jointly examined candidate indicators of well-being suitable to augment or replace GDP. For this purpose we reviewed journal papers as well as project reports on suitable dimensions of well-being and sustainability. Another step that follows during the modelling process is to explore how best to expand macroeconomic analyses as to account for key dimensions of sustainability.

Keywords: Beyond GDP; biophysical constraints; indicators; social-ecological transition; welfare state; well-being

Jel codes: D63, E01, I32, O44



List of well-being indicators

The concept of sustainable development includes wellbeing but goes beyond it. Both are multidimensional concepts as they aim to capture the complexity of socio-ecological systems. Sets of indicators are considered an appropriate tool to reduce this complexity and to account for the interaction between society, economy and the biophysical environment. Systems of indicators for sustainable development were developed by a number of international institutions including the EU and the UN.

The following list presents areas of well-being and a corresponding pool of available indicators and indicator systems which go beyond the narrow concepts of national economic accounts. The specific indicators listed here have in common that data are available for one or more EU countries. For the full list see the Appendix. The indicator list will be a contribution to a wider review within the project on suitable dimensions of well-being and sustainability and expand their analyses. A selection of indicators will be based on an assessment in the light of different theoretical frameworks, e.g. services and functionings, needs (Task 202.1).

The service / functionings-based approach can be illustrated by the energy system. Here the focus lies on energy service indicators instead of energy flows as it is not the quantity of energy used by households and companies that is relevant to welfare, but rather the energy services delivered. In buildings, for example, the energy required to deliver a "well-tempered living space" depends on the thermal quality of the building (thermal transmittance of walls, windows, rooftops, etc.) and the heating system. In this framework indicators reflect services, stocks and flows. Where appropriate, indicators differentiated by men and women will be developed.

Pool of indicators and indicator systems

- Indicator Systems
 - EU Sustainable Development Indicators (EU SDIs)
 - UN Indicators for Sustainable Development (UN ISDs)
 - OECD Better Life Indicators (BLIs)
 - IEA / IAEA Indicators for Sustainable Energy Development (ISEDs)
 - Indicators of the Environmental Performance Index (EPIs)
 - Millennium Assessment Ecosystem Service Indicators (ESIs)
 - PASHMINA Indicators²
- Composite Indices
 - Genuine Progress Indicator (GPI) / Index of Sustainable Economic Welfare (ISEW)

¹ It has to be noted that the three categories (indicator systems, composite indicators, Material follows) exhibit some overlaps (the EPI framework and MFA e.g. do also provide composite indices).

² Indicators compiled within the FP7 project PASHMINA. A short description of the indicator system is provided in the Appendix.



- Genuine Savings (GS)
- Human Development Index (HDI)
- NAMEA and Material flow accounts
 - National Accounting Matrix including Environmental Accounts (NAMEA)
 - Material flow accounts (MFA)



Table 1. Areas of well-being and corresponding indicators / indicator systems

Area	Considered in
Energy and Emissions	
Total	EU SDIs, UN ISDs, BLIs, ISEDs, NAMEA, MFA, PASHMIMA, GP / ISEW
Housing	EU SDIs, UN ISDs, BLIs, ISEDs, NAMEA, PASHMINA
Transport	EU SDIs, UN ISDs, ISEDs, PASHMINA
Industry and Services	EU SDIs, ISEDs, NAMEA, PASHMINA
Energy supply	EU SDIs, ISEDs, NAMEA, PASHMINA
Environment and Resources	
Material consumption, waste and recycling	EU SDIs, EPIs, ISEDs, NAMEA, MFA, GP / ISEW, GS,
Land use	EU SDIs, UN ISDs, ISEDs, ESSIs, EPIs, PASHMINA, GP / ISEW
Water	EU SDIs, UN ISDs, ESSIs, EPIs, GP / ISEW
Lifestock and biodiversity	EU SDIs, UN ISDs, BLIs, ESSIs, EPIs,
Equity	
Income, social security, poverty	EU SDIs, UN ISDs, BLIs, ISEDs,
Work	EU SDIs, BLIs,
Energy	ISEDs
Water	EU SDIs, UN ISDs,
Health	EU SDIs, UN ISDs,
Health	
Health status	EU SDIs, UN ISDs, BLIs, HDI
Influencing factors (e.g. nutritional status, (indoor) air pollution)	EU SDIs, UN ISDs, EPIs
Work, Income and Consumption	
Income and Consumption	BLIs, EU SDIs, GP / ISEW
Work	EU SDIs, UN ISDs, BLIs,



Table 1. Areas of well-being and corresponding indicators / indicator systems (continued)

Area	Considered in
Production	
Economic structure	EU SDIs, UN ISDs, NAMEA, ISEDs, PASHMINA
Innovation	EU SDIs, UN ISDs,
Security	
Physical security	UN ISDs, BLIs
Education	
Education	EU SDIs, UN ISDs, ISEW, GPI / ISEW, Genuine Savings, HDI
Governance and Civic Engagement	
Good governance	EU SDIs, UN ISDs
Civic engagement	EU SDIs, BLIs
Life Satisfaction	BLIs

The research leading to these results has received funding from the European Community's Seventh Framework Programme FP7/2007-2013 under grant agreement n° 290647.



Annex

A. Indicator Systems

- A.1. EU Sustainable Development Indicators
- A.2. UN Indicators for Sustainable Development
- A.3. OECD Better Life Index Indicators
- A.4. IEA / IAEA Indicators for Sustainable Energy Development
- A.5. EPI Indicators
- A.6. Millennium Assessment Ecosystem Service Indicators
- A.7. PASHMINA Indicators

B. Composite Indices

- **B.1.** Genuine Progress Indicator (GPI) / Index of Sustainable Economic Welfare (ISEW)
- **B.2.** Genuine Savings
- **B.3.** Human Development Index

C. NAMEA and Material flow accounts

- <u>C.1.</u> National Accounting Matrix including Environmental Accounts (NAMEA)
- C.2. Material flow accounts (MFA)

D. References



A.1 EU SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT INDICATORS

Headline Indicator Level II Indicator Level III Indicator

SDI-Theme: Socioeconomic Development	
Real GDP per capita, growth rate and totals	
Sub-theme: Economic development	
Investment by institutional sectors (total, government, house	shold, business)
	Dispersion of regional GDP per inhabitant
	Net national income
	Household saving rate
Sub-theme: Innovation, competitiveness and eco-efficiency	
Growth rate of labour productivity per hour worked	
	Total R&D expenditure
	Real effective exchange rate
	Turnover from innovation
	Energy intensity of the economy
Sub-theme: Employment	
Total employment rate	
	Employment rate, by gender
	Employment rate, by highest level of education attained
	Dispersion of regional employment rates, by gender
	Unemployment rate, by gender
	Unemployment rate, by age group
Indicators to be developed	
Genuine savings	
Eco-innovations	



Headline Indicator Level II Indicator Level III Indicator Level III Indicator

SDI-Theme: Sustainable Consumption and Production

Resource productivity

Sub-theme: Resource use and waste

Municipal waste generated

Domestic material consumption by material Municipal waste treatment, by type of treatment method *Generation of hazardous waste, by economic activity* Emissions of acidifying substances by source sector

Emissions of ozone precursors by source sector Emissions of particulate matter by source sector

Components of domestic material consumption

Sub-theme: Consumption patterns

Electricity consumption of households

Final energy consumption, by sector

Consumption of certain foodstuffs per inhabitant

Motorisation rate

Sub-theme: Production patterns

Organisations and sites with EMAS registration

Eco-label awards

Area under agri-environmental commitment

Area under organic farming Livestock density index

Contextual indicators

Number of households (for sub-theme Consumption patterns)

Household expenditure per inhabitant, by category (for sub-theme Consumption patterns)

Indicators to be developed

Total material consumption

Green public procurement

Share of consumption of products with an ecolabel / Awareness of ecolabels

Nitrogen balance

Ethical financing

Share of industrial production from enterprises with a formal environmental management system

Share of production of products with an ecolabel

Energy and material use per unit of output, by industrial sector



Headline Indicator Level II Indicator Level III Indicator

SDI-Theme: Social Inclusion	
At-risk-of-poverty rate, by gender	
Sub-theme: Monetary poverty and living conditions	
At-persistent-risk-of-poverty rate	
	At-risk-of-poverty rate, by age group At-risk-of-poverty rate, by household type Relative at-risk-of-poverty gap Inequality of income distribution
Sub-theme: Access to labour market	
People living in jobless households, by age group	In-work poverty Total long-term unemployment rate Unadjusted gender pay gap
Sub-theme: Education	
Early school-leavers	At-risk-of-poverty rate, by highest level of education attained Persons with low educational attainment, by age group Life-long learning Low reading literacy performance of pupils Individuals' level of computer skills Individuals' level of internet skills
Contextual indicator	
Public expenditure on education (for sub-theme Education)	
Indicators to be developed Child well-being Material deprivation Adequacy of housing conditions	



Headline Indicator Level II Indicator Level III Indicator

SDI-Theme: Demographic Changes

Employment rate of older workers

Sub-theme: Demography

Life expectancy at age 65, by gender

Total fertility rate

Crude rate of net migration

Sub-theme: Old-age income adequacy

Aggregate replacement ratio

At-risk-of-poverty rate of elderly people

Sub-theme: Public finance sustainability

General government debt

Average exit age from the labour market

Contextual indicators

Old-age-dependency ratio (for sub-theme Demographic changes)

Projected old-age dependency ratio (for sub-theme Demographic changes)

Projected evolution of EU-27 age-related public spending – baseline scenario (for sub-theme Public finance sustainability)

Projected evolution of theoretical income replacement ratios (for sub-theme Public finance sustainability)

Expenditure on care for the elderly (for sub-theme Public finance sustainability)

Indicators to be developed

Health expenditure on old age



Monetary damage of air pollution as % of GDP

A.1. EU SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT INDICATORS (continued)

Headline Indicator Level II Indicator Level III Indicator Level III Indicator

SDI-Theme: Public Health Healthy life years and life expectancy at birth, by gender Sub-theme: Health and health inequalities Death rate due to chronic diseases, by gender Healthy life years and life expectancy at age 65, by gender Suicide death rate, by age group Suicide death rate, males by age group Suicide death rate, females by age group Self reported unmet need for medical examination or treatment, Dispersion of regional death rates Sub-theme: Determinants of health Index of production of toxic chemicals, by toxicity class Population exposure to air pollution by particulate matter Population exposure to air pollution by ozone Population living in households considering that they suffer from noise Serious accident at work Indicators to be developed Incidence of chronic diseases Childhood health/diseases Deaths due to infectious food-borne diseases Index of apparent consumption of chemicals by toxicity class Dioxins and PCBs in food and feed Pesticide residues in food Overweight people, by age group Present smokers, by gender and by age group Work with a high level of job strain/stress



Headline Indicator Level II Indicator Level III Indicator

SDI-Theme: Climate Change and Energy	
Greenhouse gas emissions (CO₂e)	
Share of renewables in gross inland energy consumption	
Sub-theme: Climate change	
Greenhouse gas emissions by sector	
	Greenhouse gas emissions intensity of energy consumption Projections of greenhouse gas emissions Global surface average temperature
Sub-theme: Energy	
Energy dependency	
	Gross inland energy consumption, by fuel Electricity generated from renewable sources Share of biofuels in fuel consumption of transport Combined heat and power generation Implicit tax rate on energy
Indicators to be developed	
Radioactive waste External costs of energy use	



Headline Indicator Level II Indicator Level III Indicator Level III Indicator

SDI-Theme: Sustainable Transport

Energy consumption of transport

Sub-theme: Transport and mobility

Modal split of passenger transport Modal split of freight transport

> Volume of freight transport Volume of passenger transport

Energy consumption by transport mode

Modal share of investment in transport infrastructure

Sub-theme: Transport impacts

Greenhouse gas emissions by transport mode

People killed in road accidents

Emissions of ozone precursors from transport Emissions of particulate matter from transport

Average CO₂ emissions per km from new passenger cars

Contextual indicator

Price indices for transport (for sub-theme Transport and mobility)

Indicators to be developed

Vehicle-km by road

Use of public transport

External costs of transport activities

Fragmentation of natural and semi-natural areas (to appear either in this theme or in Natural resources, depending on the type of indicator that is developed)



Headline Indicator Level II Indicator Level III Indicator Level III Indicator

SDI-Theme: Natural Resources

Common bird index

Fish catches taken from stocks outside safe biological limits

Sub-theme: Biodiversity

Sufficiency of sites designated under the EU Habitats Directive

Deadwood on forest land

Sub-theme: Freshwater resources

Surface and groundwater abstraction as a share of available resources

Population connected to urban wastewater treatment

Biochemical oxygen demand in rivers

Sub-theme: Marine ecosystems

Concentration of mercury in fish and shellfish

Size of fishing fleet

Sub-theme: Land use

Built-up areas

Forest increment and fellings

Forest trees damaged by defoliation

Percentage of total land area at risk of soil erosion

Indicators to be developed

Biodiversity Index

Abundance and distribution of selected species

Change in status of species of European interest

Red List Index for European species

Index of toxic chemical risk to aquatic environment /

Concentration of organic matter as chemical oxygen demand of rivers

Effective fishing capacity and quotas

Structural support to fisheries and % allocated to promote environmentally friendly fishing practices

Sea grasses

Critical load exceedance for nitrogen



Headline Indicator Level II Indicator Level III Indicator Level III Indicator

SDI-Theme: Global Partnership

Official development assistance as share of gross national income

Sub-theme: Globalisation of trade

EU Imports from developing countries, by income group

EU Imports from developing countries, by group of products EU Imports from least-developed countries, by group of products Aggregated measurement of support for agriculture

Sub-theme: Financing for sustainable development

Total EU financing for developing countries, by type

Foreign direct investment in developing countries, by income group Official development assistance, by income group Untied official development assistance Bilateral official development assistance dedicated to debt Bilateral official development assistance dedicated to social services Bilateral official development assistance dedicated to

Sub-theme: Global resources management

CO₂ emissions per inhabitant in the EU and in developing countries

Contextual indicators

Population living on less than 1USD a day (for sub-theme Financing for sustainable development)

Official development assistance per capita in donor and recipient countries (for sub-theme Financing for SD)

Population with sustainable access to an improved water source (for sub-theme global resource management)

Indicators to be developed

Sales of selected fair-trade-labelled products

Share of global greenhouse gas emissions from countries having agreed limits on their emissions

Contribution of the Clean Development Mechanism to greenhouse gas emission reductions in developing countries

Global footprint



Headline Indicator Level II Indicator Level III Indicator Level III Indicator

SDI-Theme: Good Governance

Sub-theme: Policy coherence and effectiveness

New infringement cases, by policy area

Transposition of Community law by policy area

Sub-theme: Openness and participation

Voter turnout in national and EU parliamentary elections

E-government on-line availability E-government usage by individuals

Sub-theme: Economic instruments

Shares of environmental and labour taxes in total tax revenues

Contextual indicator

Level of citizens' confidence in EU institutions (for sub-theme Policy coherence and effectiveness)

Indicators to be developed

Administrative cost imposed by legislation

Impact assessment

Openness and participation

Level of involvement of consumer groups and companies

Public consultations

Proportion of environmentally harmful subsidies

Source: SEC(2005) 161 final; Šteinbuka and Wolff (2007), Eurostat (2009).



A.2. UN INDICATORS FOR SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT

Dimension / Subtheme Indicator

Social dimension	
Theme: Equity	
Poverty	Percent of Population Living below Poverty Line
	Gini Index of Income Inequality
	Unemployment Rate
Gender Equality	Ratio of Average Female Wage to Male Wage
Theme: Health	
Nutritional Status	Nutritional Status of Children
Mortality	Mortality Rate Under 5 Years Old
	Life Expectancy at Birth
Sanitation	Percent of Population with Adequate Sewage Disposal Facilities
Drinking Water	Population with Access to Safe Drinking Water
Healthcare Delivery	Percent of Population with Access to Primary Health Care
	Immunization Against Infectious Childhood Diseases
	Contraceptive Prevalence Rate
Theme: Education	
Education Level	Children Reaching Grade 5 of Primary Education
	Adult Secondary Education Achievement Level
Literacy	Adult Literacy Rate
Theme: Housing	
Living Conditions	Floor Area per Person
Theme: Security	
Crime	Number of Recorded Crimes per 100,000 Population
Theme: Population	
Population Change	Population Growth Rate
	Population of Urban Formal and Informal Settlements



A.2. UN INDICATORS FOR SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT (continued)

Dimension / Subtheme Indicator

Differsion / Subtrieffie	mucator
Environmental Dimension	
Theme: Atmosphere	
Climate Change	Emissions of Greenhouse Gases
Ozone Layer Depletion	Consumption of Ozone Depleting Substances
Air Quality	Ambient Concentration of Air Pollutants in Urban Areas
Theme: Land	
Agriculture	Arable and Permanent Crop Land Area
	Use of Fertilizers
	Use of Agricultural Pesticides
Forests	Forest Area as a Percent of Land Area
	Wood Harvesting Intensity
Desertification	Land Affected by Desertification
Urbanization	Area of Urban Formal and Informal Settlements
Theme: Oceans, Seas and Coasts	
Coastal Zone	Algae Concentration in Coastal Waters
	Percent of Total Population Living in Coastal Areas
Fisheries	Annual Catch by Major Species
Theme: Fresh Water	
Water Quantity	Annual Withdrawal of Ground and Surface Water as a Percent of Total Available Water
Water Quality	BOD in Water Bodies
	Concentration of Faecal Coliform in Freshwater
Theme: Biodiversity	
Ecosystem	Area of Selected Key Ecosystems
	Protected Area as a % of Total Area
Species	Abundance of Selected Key Species



A.2. UN INDICATORS FOR SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT (continued)

Dimension / Subtheme Indicator

Social Dimension Theme: Economic Structure Economic Performance GDP per Capita Investment Share in GDP Trade Balance of Trade in Goods and Services **Financial Status** Debt to GNP Ratio Total ODA Given or Received as a Percent of GNP **Theme: Consumption and Production Patterns Material Consumption** Intensity of Material Use **Energy Use** Annual Energy Consumption per Capita Share of Consumption of Renewable Energy Resources Intensity of Energy Use Generation of Industrial and Municipal Solid Waste Waste Generation and Management Generation of Hazardous Waste Generation of Radioactive Waste Waste Recycling and Reuse Distance Travelled per Capita by Mode of Transport Transportation

Institutional Dimension	
Theme: Institutional Framework	
Strategic Implementation of SD	National Sustainable Development Strategy
International Cooperation	Implementation of Ratified Global Agreements
Theme: Institutional Capacity	
Information Access	Number of Internet Subscribers per 1000 Inhabitants
Communication Infrastructure	Main Telephone Lines per 1000 Inhabitants
Science and Technology	Expenditure on Research and Development as a Percent of GDP
Disaster Preparedness and Response	Economic and Human Loss Due to Natural Disasters

Source: UNCSD (2001).



A.3. OECD Better Life Indicators

Dimension of well-being / Topic

Headline indicator

Secondary indicator

· ·		
Quality of Life		
Civic engagement		
	Voter turnout	Participation in other types of political activities
	Consultation on rule-making	Trust in institutions
Social connections		
Social confilections	Social network (Quality of support network)	Frequency of social contact
	Social network (Quality of Support network)	Time spent volunteering
		Trust in others
Education		
	Educational attainment	Education expectancy
	Students' cognitive skills	Lifelong learning Students' civic skills
		Students Civic skills
Environment		
	Air pollution	Environmental burden of disease
		Satisfaction with the quality of local environment
		Access to green spaces
Health		
	Life expectancy at birth	Infant mortality rate
	Self-reported health	Self-reported longstanding illness
		Self-reported limitations in daily activities
		Overweight and obesity
Life satisfaction		
	Life satisfaction	
	Affect balance	
Personal security		
	Homicide rate Assault rate	Violence against children Feeling of security
	Assault Tate	reeiiig of security
I		



A.3. OECD Better Life Indicators (continued)

Dimension of well-being / Headline indicator Secondary indicator
Topic

Subjective well-being		
	Employees working very long hours	Commuting time
	Time devoted to leisure and personal care	Satisfaction with allocation of time
	Employment rate of mothers with children of compulsory sch	nool age

Material Living Conditions		
Income and Wealth		
	Household disposable income	Household final consumption
	Household financial wealth	Subjective evaluation of material well-being
Jobs and Earnings		
	Employment rate	Involuntary part-time employment
	Long-term unemployment rate	Employees working on temporary contracts
	Personal earnings	Work accidents
Housing		
	Rooms per person	Housing cost overburden rate
	Dwellings with basic facilities	Satisfaction with housing

Source: OECD (2011).



A.4. IEA/IAEA INDICATORS FOR SUSTAINABLE ENERGY DEVELOPMENT

Dimension / Category Indicator

Economic Dimension	
Indirect driving forces	
	Population: total; urban
	GDP per capita
	End-use energy prices with and without tax/subsidy
	Shares of sectors in GDP value added
	Distance travelled per capita : total, by urban public transport mode
	Freight transport activity: total, by mode
	Floor area per capita
	Manufacturing value added by selected energy intensive industries
Indirect driving forces (within energy sector)	
	Energy intensity: manufacturing, transportation, agriculture, commercial & public services, residential sector
	Final energy intensity of selected energy intensive products
	Energy mix: final energy, electricity generation, primary energy supply
	Energy supply efficiency: fossil fuel efficiency for electricity generation
	Status of deployment of pollution abatement technologies: extent of use, average performance
Direct driving forces	
	Energy use per unit of GDP
	Expenditure on energy sector: total investments, environmental control, hydrocarbon exploration & development, R&D ,
	net energy import expenses
State	
	Energy consumption per capita
	Indigenous energy production
	Net energy import dependence



A.4. IEA/IAEA INDICATORS FOR SUSTAINABLE ENERGY DEVELOPMENT (continued)

Dimension / Category Indicator

Social Dimension (Energy accessibility and affordability)					
Indirect driving forces					
	Income inequality				
Indirect driving forces (within energy sector)	ndirect driving forces (within energy sector)				
	Ratio of daily disposable income/ private consumption per capita of 20% poorest population to the prices of electricity and major household fuels				
Direct driving forces					
	Fraction of disposable income/ private consumption spent on fuel and electricity by: average population; group of 20% poorest population				
State					
	Fraction of households: heavily dependent on non-commercial energy; without electricity				



A.4. IEA/IAEA INDICATORS FOR SUSTAINABLE ENERGY DEVELOPMENT (continued)

Dimension / Category Indicator

Environmental Dimension	
Direct driving forces	
Air pollution	
	Quantities of air pollutant emissions (SO2, NOx, particulates, CO, VOC) Quantities of greenhouse gas emissions Radionuclides in atmospheric radioactive discharges
Water pollution	
	Discharges into water basins: waste/storm water, radionuclides, oil into coastal waters
Waste	
	Generation of solid waste Generation of radioactive waste
Land	
	Land area taken up by energy facilities and infrastructure
Energy resources depletion	
	Fraction of technically exploitable capability of hydropower currently not in use Proven recoverable fossil fuel reserves Proven uranium reserves
Deforestation	
	Intensity of use of forest resources as fuel wood
State	
Air pollution	
	Ambient concentration of pollutants in urban areas : SO2, NOx, suspended particulates, CO, ozone Land area where acidification exceeds critical load
Waste	
	Accumulated quantity of solid wastes to be managed Accumulated quantity of radio-active wastes awaiting disposal
Accident risks	
	Fatalities due to accidents with breakdown by fuel chains
Energy resources depletion	
	Life time of proven fossil fuel reserves
	Life time of proven uranium reserves
Deforestation	
	Rate of deforestation



Source: IEA/IAEA (2001); IAEA et al. (2005)



A.5. ENVIRONMENTAL PERFORMANCE INDEX (EPI) 2010

Policy Category Indicators

Objective: Environmental Health				
Environmental burden of disease	Environmental burden of disease			
Air pollution (effects on humans)	ns) Indoor air pollution			
	Outdoor air pollution			
Water (effects on humans)	Access to water			
	Access to sanitation			

Objective: Ecosystem Vitality				
Air Pollution (effects on ecosystem)	Sulfur dioxide emissions per populated land area			
	Nitrogen oxides emissions per populated land area			
	Non-methane volatile organic compound emissions per populated land area			
	Ecosystem ozone			
Water (effects on ecosystem)	Water quality index			
	Water stress index			
	Water scarcity index			
Biodiversity & Habitat	Biome protection			
	Marine protection			
	Critical habitat protection			
Forestry	Growing stock change			
	Forest cover change			
Fisheries	Marine trophic index			
	Trawling intensity			
Agriculture	Agricultural water intensity			
	Agricultural subsidies			
	Pesticide regulation			
Climate Change	Greenhouse gas emissions per capita (including land use emissions)			
	CO ₂ emissions per electricity generation			
	Industrial greenhouse gas emissions intensity			

Source: EPI (2010).



A.6. MILLENIUM ASSESSMENT - ECOSYSTEM SERVICE INDICATORS

Service Category Indicator

Service	Category	mucator
PROVISIONING SERVICES		
Food	Crops	Crop production
		Dietary energy supply
		Employment in crop production and processing
		Value of crop production
	Livestock	Livestock production
		Livestock products production
		Value of livestock products production
	Capture fisheries	Employment in the marine products sector
		Fish meal in animal feed
		Fish products as a percent of total animal protein in peoples' diets
		Total fish catch
		Total marine production
		Total value of marine products
		Value of coastal products used for jewellery and curios
	Aquaculture	Fish production from aquaculture
		Total aquaculture production (including non-fish products)
	Wild foods	Number of wild species used for human food
Biological raw materials	Timber and other wood products	Employment in forest sector
		Forest biomass production
		Round wood production
		Value of forest products
		Volume of forest products used for local crafts
		Wood pulp production
	Fibres and resins, animals skins, sand,	
	and ornamental resources	Employment in fibres production
		Fibres production
		Production of wildlife-derived skins, wool and feathers
		Value of fibres production
Biomass Fuel		Charcoal production
		Fuel wood production
		Industrial energy production from forest systems
		Monetary value of fuel production



A.6. MILLENIUM ASSESSMENT - ECOSYSTEM SERVICE INDICATORS (continued)

Service	Category	Indicator
Freshwater resources		Population served by renewable water resource
		Renewable water supply
		Renewable water supply accessible to humans
		Water storage capacity
Genetic resources		Investment into natural products prospecting
		Number of species that have been the subject of major investment
		or have become a commercial product
		Value of genetic resources
Biochemicals, natural		Number of organisms from which drugs have been derived
medicines,		
and pharmaceuticals		
		Value of pharmaceutical products developed in natural systems



A.6. MILLENIUM ASSESSMENT - ECOSYSTEM SERVICE INDICATORS (continued)

Service Category Indicator

REGULATING SERVICES				
Regulating	Air quality regulation	Flux in atmospheric gases		
		Atmospheric cleansing (tropospheric oxidizing)		
Climate regulating	Global climate regulation	Atmospheric gases flux (CO ₂ , CH ₄ , etc)		
		Carbon accumulation		
		Carbon uptake		
		Cloud formation		
		Evapotranspiration		
		Carbon sequestration capacity		
		Surface albedo		
	Regional and local climate regulation	Canopy stomatal conductance		
		Cloud formation		
		Evapotranspiration		
	Water regulation	Soil water infiltration		
		Soil water storage		
	Erosion regulation	No Indicators Identified		
	Water purification and waste treatment	Amount of waste processed by ecosystems		
		Capacity of ecosystem to process waste		
		Value of ecosystem waste treatment and water purification		
	Disease regulation	Disease vector predator populations		
		Estimated change in disease burden as a result of changing ecosystems		
		Population increase in disease vectors mosquitoes following ecosystem conversion		
	Soil quality regulation	No Indicators Identified		
	Pest regulation	No Indicators Identified		
	Pollination	No Indicators Identified		



A.6. MILLENIUM ASSESSMENT - ECOSYSTEM SERVICE INDICATORS (continued)

Service	Category	Indicator		
	Natural hazard regulation Changes in seasonality of flood events			
		Economic losses associated with natural disasters		
		Flood attenuation potential: residence time of water in rivers, reservoirs, and soils		
		Floodplain water storage capacity		
		Soil capacity to transfer groundwater		
		Soil water storage capacity		
		Trends in number of damaging natural disasters		

CULTURAL SERVICES	
Aesthetic/ ethical values	Comparative value of real estate near cleaner water bodies
	Comparative value of real estate nearer to nature
	Number of nature/rural visitors
	Willingness to pay for improved water quality in local waterbodies
Spiritual and religious values	No Indicators Identified
Recreation and ecotourism	Nature and/or rural tourism employment
	Number of recreational anglers and hunters
	Spending on nature tourism
	Total recreational value
	Visitors to natural areas

Source: Millennium Assessment Report (2005).



A.7. PASHMINA ENERGY INDICATORS

	Households	Passenger transport	Freight transport	Manufacturing	Services	Energy supply
	Households	Stock of vehicles	Stock of trucks	Share of GVA in GDP	Share of GVA in GDP	Installed RES capacity
	Household size	Energy prices	Energy prices	Energy prices	Energy prices	Energy imports
	Stock of appliances	Public pkm	Tkm road			Electricity imports
	Stock of heating systems	Private pkm	Tkm rail			FEC
Context	Floor area p.c.	Km of road / km of rail	Tkm ship			
	Household income		Km of road / km of rail			
	Income inequality					
	Energy prices					
	Space heating and lighting - proxy: floor area Hot water - proxy:	Mobility - proxy: pkm	Mobility - proxy: tkm	GVA	GVA	
Energy services	population					
	Other (e.g. cooking) - proxy: number of appl.					
Energy productivity	Energy services by service type per FEC	Pkm per FEC	Tkm per FEC	GVA per FEC	GVA per FEC	Energy efficiency of fossil generation
European d	FEC per household	FEC by energy source and transport mode	FEC by energy source and transport mode	FEC by energy source	FEC by energy source	TO by energy source and installation type
Energy use and provision	FEC by activity and energy source (percentage shares)					TI by energy source and installation type
	Air pollutants	Air pollutants	Air pollutants	Air pollutants	Air pollutants	Air pollutants
Faviron montal	GHG emissions	GHG emissions	GHG emissions	GHG emissions	GHG emissions	GHG emissions
Environmental aspects						Agricultural land used for energy production
						Radioactive waste
Social aspects	Share of energy costs in average household income	Share of transport costs in average household income				
	Share of energy costs in household income of lowest 20%	Share of transport costs in household income of lowest 20%				



A.7. PASHMINA ENERGY INDICATORS (continued)

Drivers

Drivers

Drivers

Drivers

Drivers

Distance to target - RES
Distance to target - GHG
Realisation of RES potentials

Oil and gas burden

Source: Kettner et al. (2011).

Short description of the PASHMINA indicator set

The PASHMINA system of energy indicators is based on the following principles:

- It focuses on the role of energy services, flows and related stocks.
- We choose a sectoral structure for the representation of indicators as this structure allows for a comprehensive and detailed analysis of specific status and impacts regarding respective stocks, energy flows and energy services as well as underlying driving forces (disaggregated by sectors in order to identify specific conditions).

Energy services play a crucial role for the development of sustainable energy structures. It is not the quantity of energy demanded by households and companies that is relevant for welfare and development, but the amount and quality of the energy services consumed. These energy services, such as nutrition, housing, mobility and information, are provided by products (food, houses, fuel and media) combined with a wide range of capital stocks (as buildings, arable land, cars and the internet).

A given level of energy services can be provided by different combinations of technologies and energy flows. The range of available technologies and energy sources thus opens up a spectrum of options, which result in different amounts of energy flows and greenhouse gas emissions (GHG) for any given level of services. From a sustainability point of view energy services should hence be provided with the lowest possible input of (fossil) fuels and minimal greenhouse gas emissions.

As there is a strong connection between energy consumption and economic and social development we focus on indicators based on energy services that can be traced back through the energy system to energy consumption, taking into account the relevant technologies. We hence develop energy indicators starting from services that are related to the major components of final energy demand and which will be complemented by key indicators for electricity and heat production.



In the PASHMINA system of energy indicators, the indicators are arranged in a matrix system. The columns illustrate the six sectors for which the indicators are provided: energy supply, manufacturing, services, households, passenger transport and freight transport, representing the major drivers for energy use.

The rows illustrate the different levels of the energy system: The first row summarises the contextual indicators which include information on the respective relevant stocks and supplementing data (like the share of energy imports, energy prices, etc.). In the second row indicators are summarised that describe or are used to approximate energy services, such as the gross value added (GVA) of the manufacturing and the service sector as well as the number of tonne-kilometres (tkm) and passenger-kilometres (pkm). For the household sector three different energy service indicators are used: the floor area for space heating and lighting; the number of persons living in the household as approximation for hot water demand and the number of appliances as proxy for other energy services (e.g. cooking or ICT). Energy intensities – i.e. the amount of final energy per energy service – and energy efficiencies of fossil energy generation are then depicted. The next indicator row gives the energy flows – transformation input and output as well as final energy consumption – that are the result of the energy services demanded and the energy efficiencies that are defined by the quality of the capital stocks. The last two rows provide information on environmental aspects (the ecological impacts of energy use and supply, such as emissions of GHG and air pollutants) and social aspects (the economic impacts of energy use for housing and passenger transport).



B.1. GENUINE PROGRESS INDICATOR (GPI) / INDEX OF SUSTAINABLE ECONOMIC WELFARE (ISEW)

Index of Sustainable Economic Welfare (ISEW)

- + Personal consumption weighted by income distribution index
- + Value of household work
- + Services of consumer durables
- + Services of streets and highways
- + Public expenditure on health and education
- Cost of consumer durables
- Private expenditure on health and education
- Advertising expenditure
- Costs of commuting
- Cost of urbanisation
- Cost of automobile accidents
- Cost of water pollution
- Cost of air pollution
- Cost of noise pollution
- Loss of wetlands
- Loss of agricultural land
- Use of non-renewable natural resources
- Value of long-term environmental hazards
- +/- Net capital growth
- +/- Changes in international position
- = ISEW



Genuine Progress Indicator

- + Personal consumption weighted by income distribution index
- + Value of household work and parenting
- + Value of higher education
- + Value of volunteer work
- + Services of consumer durables
- + Services of highways and streets
- Cost of crime
- Loss of leisure time
- Cost of unemployment
- Cost of consumer durables
- Cost of commuting
- Cost of household pollution abatement
- Cost of automobile accidents
- Cost of water pollution
- Cost of air pollution
- Cost of noise pollution
- Loss of wetlands
- Loss of farmland
- -/+ Loss of forest area and damage from logging roads
- Depletion of non-renewable energy resources
- Carbon dioxide emissions damage
- Cost of ozone depletion
- +/- Net capital investment
- +/- Net foreign borrowing
 - = GPI

Source: Hoffren (2012).



B.2. GENUINE SAVING / ADJUSTED NET SAVING

Gross National Savings

- Consumption of fixed capital

Net National Savings

- + Education expenditures
- Energy depletion
- Mineral depletion
- Net forest depletion
- PM₁₀ damage
- CO₂ damage

Genuine Savings

Source: World Bank (2012).



B.3. HUMAN DEVELOPMENT INDEX (HDI)

Sub-Index	Indicato
-----------	----------

	Life expectancy index	Life expectancy in years	
HDI	Education index	Mean years of schooling Expected years of schooling	
	GNI index	Per capita income (in PPP)	

Source: UNDP (2012).



C.1. NATIONAL ACCOUNTING MATRIX INCLUDING ENVIRONMENTAL ACCOUNTS $(NAMEA)^3$

Economic figures Production value Gross value added Labour force

Environmental material flows	
Material input	
Fossil materials	
	Domestic extraction
	Imports
Biomass	
	Domestic extraction (excl. wood)
	Domestic extraction of wood
	Imports (excl. wood and wood products)
	Imports of wood and wood products
Mineral materials	
	Domestic extraction of metallic minerals
	Domestic extraction of non-metallic minerals
	Imports of metallic minerals
	Imports of non-metallic minerals
Energy consumption	
Emission-relevant non-renewable energy sources	
Crude oil	
Emission-relevant renewable energy sources	
Non emission-relevant renewable energy sources	
Other non emission-relevant energy sources	
Air emissions	
SO ₂	
_	
NO _x	
1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1	
CH ₄	
CO	
CO ₂	22.5
	CO ₂ from fossil sources
	CO ₂ from biogeneous sources
	CO ₂ from other sources
N ₂ O	
NH ₃	
PM ₁₀	
Hazardous wastes	
Non-hazardous wastes	

³ The tables are provided for different industry branches as well as for households and agriculture.



C.1. NATIONAL ACCOUNTING MATRIX INCLUDING ENVIRONMENTAL ACCOUNTS (NAMEA) continued

Environmental expenditure Environmental protection expenditure Protection of ambient air and climate Waste management Environmental taxes Energy taxes Transport taxes Resource taxes Pollution taxes

Source: Statistics Austria (2009).



C.2. MATERIAL FLOW ACCOUNTS

Classification of material inputs (broad categories)

Domestic extraction (used)

Fossil fuels Minerals Biomass

Imports

Raw materials

Semi-manufactured products

Finished products
Other products

Packaging material imported with products Waste imported for final treatment and disposal

Memorandum items for balancing (oxygen for combustion, etc.)

Unused domestic extraction

Unused extraction from mining and quarrying

Unused biomass from harvest Soil excavation and dredging

Indirect flows associated to imports

Raw material equivalents of imported products
Unused extraction associated to imported products



C.2. MATERIAL FLOW ACCOUNTS (continued)

Classification of material outputs (broad categories)

Emissions and wastes

Emissions to air Waste landfilled Emissions to water

Dissipative use of products and dissipative losses

Dissipative use of products

Dissipative losses

Exports

Raw materials

Semi-manufactured products

Finished products
Other products

Packaging material exported with products Waste exported for final treatment and disposal

Memorandum items for balancing

Water vapour from combustion Water evaporation from products

Respirations of humans and livestock (CO₂ and water vapour)

Disposal of unused domestic extraction

Unused extraction from mining and quarrying Unused extraction from biomass harvest Soil excavation and dredging

Indirect flows associated to exports

Raw material equivalents of exported products Unused extraction associated to exported products



C.2. MATERIAL FLOW ACCOUNTS (continued)

Classification of material stock changes	
Total (gross) additions	
Infrastructure and buildings Other (machinery, durable goods, etc.)	Construction minerals Metals Wood Other construction materials Metals Other minerals
Removals (incl. losses)	
Infrastructure and buildings by demolition by dissipative losses Other (machinery, durable goods, etc.) by discard	Construction minerals Metals Wood Other construction materials Construction minerals Metals Wood Other construction materials
by dissipative losses	Other minerals Metals Other minerals
Net additions to material stock	
Infrastructure and buildings	Construction minerals Metals Wood Other construction materials
Other (machinery, durable goods, etc.)	Metals Other minerals



C.2. MATERIAL FLOW ACCOUNTS (continued)

Key indicators

DMI (Direct Material Input) = Domestically extracted raw materials + imports

DMC (Domestic Material Consumption) = Domestic extraction (used) + Imports - Exports

PTB (Physical Trade Balance) = Imports - Exports

TMC (total material consumption) = TMR (Domestic extraction (used and unused) + Imports + indirect flows imported) - Exports - indirect flows exported

Source: European Communities (2001).



D. REFERENCES

- EPI (2010) Yale Center for Environmental Law and Policy and Center for International Earth Science Information Network Environmental Performance Index.
- European Commission (2005) Sustainable Development Indicators to monitor the implementation of the EU Sustainable Development Strategy. SEC(2005) 161 final.
- European Communities (2001) Economy-wide material flow accounts and derived indicators A methodological guide. Lourgemburg.
- Eurostat (2009) Indicators for Monitoring the EU Sustainable Development Strategy.
- Hoffren, J. (2012) Measuring Regional Finnish Welfare by Genuine Progress Indicator Applications. Groningen.
- IEA and IAEA (2001) Indicators for Sustainable Energy Development. Vienna.
- IAEA et al. (2005) Energy Indicators for Sustainable Development: Guidelines and Methodologies. Vienna.
- Kettner, C., Kletzan-Slamanig D., Köppl, A., Köberl, K. (2011) Indicators for Sustainable Energy Development the PASHMINA Approach Working Paper prepared for the PASHMINA project.
- Millennium Assessment Report (2005) Ecosystems and human well-being, Washington.
- OECD (2011) How's life? Measuring well-being. Paris.
- Statistics Austria (2009) Integrierte NAMEA (National Accounting Matrix including Environmental Accounts.
- Šteinbuka, I., Wolff, P. (2007) Indicators and Better Policy-making: the Case of Sustainable Development. http://www.ec.europa.eu/environment/eussd/
- UNCSD (2001) Indicators of Sustainable Development: Guidelines and methodologies. http://www.un.org/esa/sustdev/publications/indisd-mg2001.pdf
- UNDP (2001) Human Development Index (HDI). http://hdr.undp.org/en/statistics/hdi/
- World Bank (2012) Adjusted Net Saving. http://go.worldbank.org/3AWKN2ZOY0



Project Information

Welfare, Wealth and Work for Europe

A European research consortium is working on the analytical foundations for a socio-ecological transition

Abstract

Europe needs a change: The financial crisis has exposed long neglected deficiencies in the present growth path, most visibly in unemployment and public debt. At the same time Europe has to cope with new challenges ranging from globalisation and demographic shifts to new technologies and ecological challenges. Under the title of Welfare, Wealth and Work for Europe – WWWforEurope – a European research consortium is laying the analytical foundations for a new development strategy that enables a socio-ecological transition to high levels of employment, social inclusion, gender equity and environmental sustainability. The four year research project within the 7th Framework Programme funded by the European Commission started in April 2012. The consortium brings together researchers from 33 scientific institutions in 12 European countries and is coordinated by the Austrian Institute of Economic Research (WIFO). Project coordinator is Karl Aiginger, director of WIFO.

For details on WWWforEurope see: www.foreurope.eu

Contact for information

Kristin Smeral

WWWforEurope – Project Management Office
WIFO – Austrian Institute of Economic Research
Arsenal, Objekt 20
1030 Vienna

wwwforeurope-office@wifo.ac.at

T: +43 1 7982601 332

Domenico Rossetti di Valdalbero

DG Research and Innovation
European Commission

Domenico.Rossetti-di-Valdalbero@ec.europa.eu



Partners

WIFO	Austrian Institute of Economic Research	WIFO	Austria
BUDAPEST	Budapest Institute	Budapest Institute	Hungary
Université Nice Sophu Antipolis	Nice Sophia Antipolis University	UNS	France
>eco l <mark>ogic</mark>	Ecologic Institute	Ecologic	Germany
Ernst-Abbe-Fachhechschule Jena Hochschule für angewandte Wissenschaften	University of Applied Sciences Jena	EAH Jena	Germany
Find University Boden Listin University to Boden Find University or Boden Find University or Boden Find University or Boden	Free University of Bozen/Bolzano	FUB	Italy
GEFRA Münster . Germany	Institute for Financial and Regional Analyses	GEFRA	Germany
GOETHE ONLYERS ITAT	Goethe University Frankfurt	GUF	Germany
• I. C. L. E. I. Local Governments for Swatainability	ICLEI - Local Governments for Sustainability	ICLEI	Germany
Ekonomický ústav SAV Intilitet of Economic Rosanti SAS	Institute of Economic Research Slovak Academy of Sciences	IER SAVBA	Slovakia
Ifw	Kiel Institute for the World Economy	IfW	Germany
	Institute for World Economics, RCERS, HAS	KRTK MTA	Hungary
LEUVEN	KU Leuven	KUL	Belgium
étiondel University In Marro	Mendel University in Brno	MUAF	Czech Republic
ÖIR	Austrian Institute for Regional Studies and Spatial Planning	OIR	Austria
}{ uolicy network	Policy Network	policy network	United Kingdom
RATIO	Ratio	Ratio	Sweden
SURREY	University of Surrey	SURREY	United Kingdom
TECHNISCHE UNIVERSITÄT WIEN Vienna University of Technology	Vienna University of Technology	TU WIEN	Austria
UAB Universitat Autònoma de Barcelona	Universitat Autònoma de Barcelona	UAB	Spain
	Humboldt-Universität zu Berlin	UBER	Germany
o Province	University of Economics in Bratislava	UEB	Slovakia
universiteit hhasselt	Hasselt University	UHASSELT	Belgium
ALPEN-ADRIA ONIVERSITÄT Social ecology vienna	Alpen-Adria-Universität Klagenfurt	UNI-KLU	Austria
DUNDEE	University of Dundee	UNIVDUN	United Kingdom
	Università Politecnica delle Marche	UNIVPM	Italy
UNIVERSITY ^{OF} BIRMINGHAM	University of Birmingham	UOB	United Kingdom
	University of Pannonia	UP	Hungary
Universiteit Utrecht	Utrecht University	UU	Netherlands
Windowsky waterskanke watersky watersky watersky watersky en	WU - Vienna University of Economics and Business	WU	Austria
ZEW Jonatore Un françalente Miller de la Carte de la	Centre for European Economic Research	ZEW	Germany
Coventry	Coventry University	COVUNI	United Kingdom
IVORY TOWER	Ivory Tower	IVO	Sweden