

Bouheraoua, Said; Fares Djafri

Article

Adoption of the COSO methodology for internal Sharī'ah audit

ISRA International Journal of Islamic Finance

Provided in Cooperation with:

International Shari'ah Research Academy for Islamic Finance (ISRA), Kuala Lumpur

Suggested Citation: Bouheraoua, Said; Fares Djafri (2022) : Adoption of the COSO methodology for internal Sharī'ah audit, ISRA International Journal of Islamic Finance, ISSN 2289-4365, Emerald, Bingley, Vol. 14, Iss. 2, pp. 221-235,
<https://doi.org/10.1108/IJIF-04-2020-0071>

This Version is available at:

<https://hdl.handle.net/10419/302032>

Standard-Nutzungsbedingungen:

Die Dokumente auf EconStor dürfen zu eigenen wissenschaftlichen Zwecken und zum Privatgebrauch gespeichert und kopiert werden.

Sie dürfen die Dokumente nicht für öffentliche oder kommerzielle Zwecke vervielfältigen, öffentlich ausstellen, öffentlich zugänglich machen, vertreiben oder anderweitig nutzen.

Sofern die Verfasser die Dokumente unter Open-Content-Lizenzen (insbesondere CC-Lizenzen) zur Verfügung gestellt haben sollten, gelten abweichend von diesen Nutzungsbedingungen die in der dort genannten Lizenz gewährten Nutzungsrechte.

Terms of use:

Documents in EconStor may be saved and copied for your personal and scholarly purposes.

You are not to copy documents for public or commercial purposes, to exhibit the documents publicly, to make them publicly available on the internet, or to distribute or otherwise use the documents in public.

If the documents have been made available under an Open Content Licence (especially Creative Commons Licences), you may exercise further usage rights as specified in the indicated licence.



<https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/>

Adoption of the COSO methodology for internal Shari'ah audit

Internal
Shari'ah audit

Said Bouheraoua and Fares Djafri

ISRA Research Management Centre, INCEIF University, Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia

221

Abstract

Purpose – Islamic financial institutions (IFIs) are required to establish a Shari'ah Governance Framework (SGF) to strengthen their Shari'ah-compliance mechanism and ensure that all relevant IFI regulations are in line with Shari'ah rules and principles. Effective implementation of the Shari'ah-compliance function will further promote stakeholder confidence, as well as the integrity of IFIs, by reducing Shari'ah non-compliance risks. This study aims to examine the internal control framework developed by the Committee of Sponsoring Organizations of the Treadway Commission (COSO) and explore the extent to which it can be incorporated in the Shari'ah-compliance function of IFIs.

Design/methodology/approach – This study adopts a qualitative method of inquiry, utilizing the inductive method and content analysis to build comprehensive knowledge that will assist in exploring the framework of COSO methodology and the extent to which it can be adopted by IFIs.

Findings – The findings indicate that the existing frameworks of Shari'ah governance, whether that of the Accounting and Auditing Organization for Islamic Financial Institutions (AAOIFI) or Bank Negara Malaysia (BNM), need to be further developed. Therefore, the adoption of COSO methodology in the internal Shari'ah audit of IFIs, as suggested by AAOIFI, is not only possible but desirable. The study also finds that the COSO framework places the highest priority on risk management in that it makes it an integral part of the decision-making process in all the institution's activities. As a result, incorporating the comprehensive COSO risk management structure within the Shari'ah-compliance function will enhance risk management in IFIs.

Originality/value – This study highlights the importance of the COSO internal control framework and examines its components, principles and the possibility of its adoption by IFIs. The findings of this study are expected to contribute to enhancing the Shari'ah-compliance function of IFIs.

Keywords COSO, IFIs, Internal control, Shari'ah audit, Shari'ah compliance, Shari'ah governance

Paper type Research paper

Received 8 April 2020
Revised 30 August 2020
7 August 2021
26 April 2022
3 June 2022
Accepted 3 June 2022

Introduction

The development of the Islamic finance industry has led to the progression of the organisational structure of Islamic financial institutions (IFIs), especially in strengthening the concept of adherence to the principles and provisions of Shari'ah (Islamic law).

Shari'ah supervision and Shari'ah audit are forms of administrative control to ensure that all operations and transactions carried out by IFIs are Shari'ah-compliant. Given this importance, the Accounting and Auditing Organization for Islamic Financial Institutions (AAOIFI), in its ninth standard on governance, paid special attention to the Shari'ah-compliance function, calling for the adoption of a comprehensive and integrated control system to manage the risks that IFIs may face. The standard identifies the Committee of Sponsoring Organizations of the Treadway Commission (COSO) model as one of the advanced and comprehensive internal control methodologies and calls for incorporating the Shari'ah-compliance function within the comprehensive COSO risk management structure (AAOIFI, 2019). This suggestion by AAOIFI triggered the concerns of industry experts on



© Said Bouheraoua and Fares Djafri. Published in *ISRA International Journal of Islamic Finance*. Published by Emerald Publishing Limited. This article is published under the Creative Commons Attribution (CC BY 4.0) licence. Anyone may reproduce, distribute, translate and create derivative works of this article (for both commercial and non-commercial purposes), subject to full attribution to the original publication and authors. The full terms of this licence may be seen at <http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/legalcode>

ISRA International Journal of
Islamic Finance
Vol. 14 No. 2, 2022
pp. 221-235
Emerald Publishing Limited
e-ISSN: 2289-4365
p-ISSN: 0128-1976
DOI 10.1108/IJIF-04-2020-0071

the implementation of the COSO framework for Shari'ah audit. Several questions arise in this regard, including:

- (1) How efficient and effective is the COSO methodology in achieving Shari'ah oversight objectives?
- (2) Is COSO's methodology in harmony with Shari'ah principles and objectives?
- (3) Is it possible to integrate COSO's methodology within the internal Shari'ah audit process?

This research aims at explaining the COSO methodology, its components and principles and the extent to which it can be adopted within the internal Shari'ah audit process of IFIs. For this purpose, this paper is organised as follows: the next section provides a review of the literature on the COSO methodology for internal Shari'ah audit. It is followed by a discussion on Shari'ah governance and its role and principles. The next section then deliberates on the COSO internal audit framework, its components and principles. Thereafter, Shari'ah audit and its applications in IFIs are discussed. The key contribution of the paper lies in the deliberation on the extent to which the COSO methodology can be applied to the internal Shari'ah audit processes of IFIs. The final section presents the conclusion and recommendations of the study.

Literature review

Significant literature is already in place regarding the application of the COSO framework of internal control in conventional finance. For instance, [Rezaee \(1995\)](#) explained the importance of a COSO report for internal auditors and urged them to work closely with management and external auditors. The findings revealed that COSO reports have a significant positive impact on the better recognition of the proactive role of internal auditors. [Lawson et al. \(2017\)](#) surveyed United States (US) accounting professionals, principally from large publicly traded firms, to examine views related to the framework and its impact on key areas related to internal controls. The results revealed that respondents view the COSO framework and its 17 principles as a set of rules for achieving effective internal controls. Likewise, [Udeh \(2019\)](#) explored the effectiveness of the COSO framework. The findings showed that timely adopters of the COSO framework continued to demonstrate fewer instances of auditor-reported material weaknesses than late-adopters.

Besides, comparative studies conducted on the implementation of the COSO framework show that major regulatory and standard-setting bodies' presentations of their internal controls are drafted based on the COSO model. This is reflected in the model developed by The Basel Committee on Banking Supervision for internal control of financial institutions and the Cadbury Commission's report; both models are mainly based on the COSO framework for internal audit ([Briciu et al., 2014](#)).

IFIs have also recognised the importance of benefiting from the COSO framework in establishing internal Shari'ah control. This realisation is supported by AAOIFI and other regulatory and supervisory bodies. AAOIFI decided to incorporate the framework in its Shari'ah Standard of Governance Standard No. 9 on "Shari'ah Compliance Function". AAOIFI stated explicitly that the Shari'ah compliance chart is "developed in line with the five key pillars of the COSO integrated framework" ([AAOIFI, 2019](#)). The standard also stated in clause 38: "IFIs shall consider adopting a comprehensive internal control or enterprise risk management framework (e.g. those developed by COSO)". The same consideration of the COSO framework was presented in the AAOIFI Exposure Draft of Waqf Governance Standard, clause 56. The draft states: "The custodian shall also establish and cause to implement and follow a control framework in line with global best practices (e.g. the

Committee of Sponsoring Organizations of the Treadway Commission's (COSO's)" (AAOIFI, 2018). This is in addition to the incorporation of the framework by many IFIs in their Shari'ah Governance Framework (SGF) and policy documents. Despite the importance given to the COSO framework, not much literature concerning its applications in Shari'ah audit and control has been produced by researchers and industry practitioners.

In the Islamic arena, the studies conducted on the COSO framework can be divided into two categories. The first category stresses the general importance of COSO in Shari'ah audit and its position in the internal Shari'ah control undertaking. Hidayah (2014) proposed a modified triple line of defense for IFIs based on the COSO framework. Similarly, Zakaria *et al.* (2019) highlighted the importance of the implementation of the COSO framework in internal Shari'ah control and cited the study of Shafii and Salleh (2010) as one of the first to discuss the Shari'ah internal control system and to adopt the COSO framework in defining internal Shari'ah control. However, the study did not comprehensively explain the framework, nor did it present any assessment from the Shari'ah perspective (Zakaria *et al.*, 2019).

The second category is concerned with practical examination of the COSO framework either by evaluating its application in specific products or conducting empirical studies by interviewing stakeholders to assess its importance and the extent of its implementation in internal Shari'ah audit. For instance, Aden Abdi (2017) examined the possibility of the implementation of the COSO framework in Islamic finance. The research concluded that although the COSO framework is useful for Islamic finance, it misses some essential elements related to internal Shari'ah control, especially the Shari'ah-compliance aspect and the party responsible for Shari'ah compliance as well as the Shari'ah supervisory board (SSB) as a line of defense. Yazkhiruni *et al.* (2018) interviewed chiefs of internal audit, managers of internal audit department, Shari'ah committee members, external auditors and academicians on the implementation of the COSO framework in enterprise risk management and found that some respondents confirmed they are adopting the COSO framework. Likewise, Abd Rahman *et al.* (2018) stated that the COSO framework is considered an effective methodology as it contains all facets for ensuring an effective internal control system. This was supported by the final statement and recommendations of the Shura Eighth Shari'ah Audit Conference, which was held in the Sultanate of Oman in 2019. The conference recommended the adoption of the COSO Shari'ah audit framework as one of the most advanced and comprehensive internal control frameworks. Furthermore, the conference recommended that the entities working in the field of Shari'ah consultancy and audit should provide professional support to Islamic financial institutions on how to adopt the COSO methodology in the internal Shari'ah control system, develop the professional capabilities of the institutions' staffs by holding workshops and training programs and carry out the necessary technical studies that illustrate the practical application of the COSO framework (Shura, 2019).

From the above studies, it can be concluded that the efforts undertaken by researchers have focused on examining the efficiency of the COSO internal control framework and its importance for internal Shari'ah control; however, they have not addressed its compliance to Shari'ah requirements and how to incorporate it within the existing SGF of IFIs. This gap was highlighted in CIBAFI's comments on the "AAOIFI Exposure Draft on Governance Standard No. 9 on Shari'ah Compliance Function" as follows:

The COSO's pillars are defined in a purely secular context. If they are to be cited, therefore and in order to educate the SSB members and those charged with governance about their application to the Shari'ah-compliance function, the standard should elaborate more on linking the COSO components to Shari'ah requirements (CIBAFI, 2017, p. 5).

The present study goes beyond CIBAFI's concern about the secular context. It aims to undertake an in-depth examination of the extent to which the COSO framework complies with Shari'ah principles and fundamentals and the possibility of adopting it within the SGF of IFIs.

Shari'ah governance: its role and principles

Many definitions have been provided for governance in the conventional law context, including: the system by which companies are managed and their activities controlled (Alamgir, 2007). The National Bank of Egypt (2003) defined it as the aggregate "rules of the game" that are used to oversee the business from within and by which the board of directors (BOD) supervises it to protect the interests and financial rights of the shareholders.

It is worth noting that there is no difference between Shari'ah governance and the governance of conventional companies except in terms of the law that governs them. Shari'ah governance, as the name suggests, is derived from Islamic law while conventional governance is based on statutory laws. IFIs are required to have an SGF to strengthen their Shari'ah-compliance mechanism and ensure that all relevant IFI regulations comply with Shari'ah rules and principles. Successful implementation of the SGF will further elevate stakeholder confidence as well as the trustworthiness of the Islamic finance industry by decreasing Shari'ah non-compliance risks. That will ultimately contribute to maintaining financial stability. Bank Negara Malaysia (BNM) provides a good benchmark in this regard as it places increased emphasis on ensuring that the operations of the Islamic financial system are in line with the SGF. Indeed, BNM has developed the SGF for IFIs with the main objective of enriching the function of the board, the Shari'ah committee and the management in discharging their duties in matters relating to Shari'ah.

AAOIFI also confirmed that governance in IFIs far exceeds the limits of governance in conventional institutions, given the additional social and religious dimensions of the former (AAOIFI, 2004). Likewise, the Islamic Financial Services Board (IFSB, 2009) expressed the concept thus: a set of legislative measures through which IFIs confirm that there is independent and effective Shari'ah supervision for each of the following structures and processes:

- (1) Issuing fatwas and related decisions governing the work of the financial institutions.
- (2) Disseminating information related to these fatwas and decisions among the employees in Islamic financial services institutions who are responsible for monitoring daily activities.
- (3) Internal Shari'ah review and audit to verify the compliance of the transactions conducted in the financial institution with the Shari'ah provisions.
- (4) A yearly Shari'ah review to confirm that the internal Shari'ah supervision and audit were implemented appropriately and as required.

The mandatory nature of Shari'ah governance in Islamic financial institutions

The mandatory nature of Shari'ah governance for IFIs means that the decisions of the SSB are binding in Shari'ah issues related to the bank, as is the achievement of the Shari'ah principles included in Shari'ah governance. These include justice, honesty, trustworthiness, accuracy, clarity, the prevention of inequity and the preservation of rights. Therefore, the SSB's role is more than consultative; rather, it includes guidance, supervision and oversight. This is clearly stated in the revised SGF for IFIs issued by BNM (2019). SGF 2019 obliges the SSB to be accountable for the soundness and accuracy of decisions related to business and risk practices. In this regard, the Shari'ah committee shall inform the SSB about any Shari'ah issue or matter that may affect the safety and soundness of the IFI. It is worth noting that the basic principle in Shari'ah supervision of Islamic banks is oversight of the bank's business. It is not limited to developing products or following up on their implementation. Rather, it makes sure that all business and all aspects of the bank are in compliance with the principles and provisions of the Shari'ah.

Similarly, AAOIFI has issued governance standards on SSBs which state that the SSB is assigned with the responsibility of reviewing, managing and supervising the activities of the IFI in order to ensure that its financial products and services are in compliance with the principles and precepts of Shari'ah (AAOIFI, 2015). Likewise, it is stated in AAOIFI Shari'ah Standard No. 29 that it is the duty of the SSB to submit fatwas to the bank based on the relationship that exists between them and that it is the duty of the institution to refer to the board on Shari'ah matters. In principle, the seeker of a fatwa, in this case the bank, can exert the utmost effort to choose the best fatwas or opinions; however, the laws of these institutions require them to accept and implement the fatwas issued by their own SSBs (AAOIFI, 2007). AAOIFI (2007) emphasised that the bank is obligated to follow the decisions of the SSB and cannot refer to and adopt the decisions of other fatwa bodies without the permission of its own Shari'ah board.

Based on the above, Shari'ah governance is concerned with practices, systems, policies, procedures and measures by which the institution's performance is controlled and monitored and its problems addressed. This is where the interaction between governance and internal Shari'ah oversight becomes apparent. It is a crucial part of the governance of IFIs that aims to ensure that the transactions undertaken by the institution are in compliance with the provisions of Shari'ah. It also aims to reduce the risks of Shari'ah non-compliance that Islamic banks may face. In this respect, Mashal (2015) stated that governance represents an evolution of oversight and is based on three main axes: moral behavior, the risk management process and the process of oversight and accountability. In addition, internal SSBs are vigilant in identifying Shari'ah non-compliance risks, dealing with them and minimizing them. Since internal control is an important part of corporate governance, ensuring that the approved goals are achieved and that risks facing the institution are reduced, the next topic will address what internal control is and its principles and goals according to the COSO concept.

COSO internal audit framework

COSO was established in 1985 under the chairmanship of James Treadway, the former Commissioner of the US Securities and Exchange Commission. The Committee includes professional bodies working in the accounting and financial field in the United States of America (USA). It includes the five largest private sector organisations in the USA: the American Institute of Certified Public Accountants (AICPA), the Institute of Internal Auditors (IIA), the Financial Executives International (FEI), the American Accounting Association (AAA) and the Institute of Management Accountants (IMA). Collectively, they are called COSO in consideration of their funding provision to the Committee. The Committee was commissioned to produce an integrated and comprehensive design for internal control that came to be widely adopted in the USA (Uwadiae, 2015). This framework, known as the COSO framework, was designed to assist companies in establishing, correcting and improving the internal control system. Internal control, according to this framework, is considered important for the organisation's operations and financial reports and cannot be neglected because it determines the quality of the financial statements. It provides "reasonable assurance" that the amounts presented in the financial statements are correct and establish a reliable basis for making sound decisions (COSO, 2013).

The application of the internal control framework, according to the COSO concept, provides a solid basis for determining the degree of assurance provided by the regulatory controls designed at the institutional level. COSO defines internal control as:

a process, effected by an entity's board of directors, management and other personnel, designed to provide reasonable assurance regarding the achievement of objectives relating to operations, reporting and compliance (COSO, 2013, p. 3).

This definition reflects some of the basic concepts of internal control, namely:

- (1) It is not an end in itself but a means to achieve goals.
- (2) It is not just policies, procedures and systems but the actions that people take at every level of the organisation to affect internal control. Hence, it must be accomplished by competent and qualified persons.
- (3) It does not provide an absolute assurance but, rather, a reasonable assurance regarding the institution's achievement of its objectives to the management and the BOD.

Besides, the objectives of internal control, according to the COSO framework, are as follows:

Operations objectives: They relate to the efficient and effective use of all the entity's resources, including operational and financial performance goals and safeguarding assets against loss.

Reporting objectives: They relate to internal and external financial and non-financial reporting directed at the use of what is produced and its documentation with reliable and transparent reports submitted to the management.

Compliance objectives: They relate to compliance with the laws and regulations that the organization is subject to (COSO, 2013, p. 3).

In light of the above, it is clear that internal control, according to the COSO framework, is a comprehensive system designed to help achieve the entity's goals through the efficient and effective use of all the institution's resources. It does so through specific criteria, concepts and principles that are used to evaluate the internal control system. The next section examines the development of the COSO framework.

Development of the COSO framework

As previously mentioned, the main work assigned to COSO is to design an integrated framework to help companies establish, evaluate and improve the internal control system. The first version of the internal control framework was issued in 1992 and became widely accepted, particularly in the USA. In 2013, a revised and refined version of the COSO internal control framework was issued, containing the components applied under the COSO framework of 1992 with the addition of a set of principles and concepts. With regard to risk management, in 2004 COSO issued the integrated risk management framework. An updated version was issued in 2017 titled "Enterprise Risk Management (ERM) Integration of Strategies and Performance" (COSO, 2017). Since the subject of this research relates to internal control, it will focus on the stages of the development of internal control for the COSO framework.

COSO internal control framework – 1992 edition

The first version of COSO framework for evaluating and activating the system of internal control, issued in 1992, was based on five interrelated components: control environment, risk assessment, control activities, information and communication and monitoring activities. The overall objective of this framework was to provide reasonable assurance of achievement of the institution's goals at the following levels: effectiveness and efficiency of operational processes, reliability of financial reports and compliance with laws and regulations.

COSO internal control framework – 2013 updated version

Since the introduction of the first COSO framework in 1992, several amendments have occurred in the working environment and the organisational and operational laws of

institutions. This prompted COSO to review and amend the COSO framework in accordance with developments in the internal control system. In 2013, the revised and improved COSO internal control framework was issued. It contains the same components applied in the COSO 1992 framework along with the addition of a set of 17 principles that represent the basic concepts of the five control components that are relied upon in evaluating the internal control system (COSO, 2013).

Table 1 summarises the five components and 17 principles of internal control according to the COSO 2013 framework. The COSO 2013 framework assumes that these 17 principles work with one another in an integrated dynamic framework to reduce risks to reasonable and acceptable levels. The 17 principles are further supported by a set of 87 points that must also be given due attention. They represent the instructions that help design the implementation of the internal control procedure and evaluation of whether these principles have been adopted and used (Deloitte, 2014). It thus results in an effective internal control system.

The revised COSO 2013 thus focused on the risk management process. This reflected the realisation that it is important to shift risk management from a separate or occasional activity distributed among a number of the institution's units to an efficient, integrated management activity. In addition, the COSO 2013 framework indicated that risk management is an integral part of the decision-making process in an entity's activities and is crucial for achieving goals and improving performance. It indicated that an effective internal control system is not simply a matter of strict adherence to policies and procedures; rather, it goes beyond that to the exercise of judgement and discretion. This is a relative matter that requires competence on the part of those carrying out the work. The BOD, executive management and employees throughout the institution need to use their judgement to define the necessary and effective control limits. Likewise, their exercise of judgement and assessment of matters are used on an ongoing basis to develop the control system at the institutional level.

Shari'ah audit and its applications in Islamic financial institutions

Before evaluating the COSO methodology or framework for Shari'ah audit, it is necessary to present the methodologies of the most prominent supervisory and oversight bodies regarding internal Shari'ah audit. As the limitations of this paper do not allow for the study of many models, only AAOIFI's and BNM's methodologies on Shari'ah audit will be presented.

AAOIFI's internal Shari'ah audit approach

AAOIFI has examined Shari'ah audit in its Governance Standard for Islamic Financial Institutions (GSIFI No. 3). It defines internal Shari'ah audit as the examination and evaluation of the institution's commitment to the provisions and principles of Shari'ah and the fatwas, guidelines and instructions issued by the institution's SSB. Accordingly, internal Shari'ah audit is an essential part of the organs of governance of the IFI and it is based on a set of general requirements that include:

Independence and objectivity: the organisational status of the internal Shari'ah control shall be sufficient to accomplish its responsibilities. This is achieved by placing internal Shari'ah control in the organisational structure at a position no lower than the level of the Internal Control Department. Further, the internal Shari'ah control personnel are to receive full and continuous support from the management and the BOD. On the other hand, objectivity includes independence of thought and attitude that assist internal Shari'ah audit to reach objective conclusions based on the work the internal Shari'ah auditors have performed and its results. Therefore, the independence and objectivity of the internal Shari'ah auditors are vital for public confidence. This will ultimately promote the objectives of Shari'ah (*maqāsid al-Shari'ah*) which aim at realizing human wellbeing

Components	Description of the components	Principles
Control Environment	Control environment represents the philosophy and vision of the institution, or it is the governance culture of management, which impacts on the effectiveness of the other components of internal control. It denotes a set of standards, processes and structures that the organisation relies on to implement internal control. It includes the integrity and ethical values of the institution and the standards that enable the board of directors to carry out its responsibilities in overseeing the governance and organisational structure and in defining powers and responsibilities	(1) The organisation demonstrates a commitment to integrity and ethical values (2) The BOD demonstrates independence from management (3) The BOD establishes structures, reporting lines and appropriate responsibilities in the pursuit of objectives (4) Commitment to attract, develop and retain competent individuals (5) Holding individuals accountable for their internal control responsibility
Risk Management	It is the possibility that an event will occur and adversely affect the achievement of [an organisation's] objectives. It indicates that each organisation may face a variety of risks, external and internal. The assessment of risks, according to the COSO concept, is a continuous dynamic process for identifying and assessing the risks that threaten the achievement of the institution's goals	(6) Specifying objectives with sufficient clarity to identify and assess risks (7) Identifying risks across the entity and analyzing them to determine how they should be managed (8) Considering the potential for fraud as a possible risk (9) Identifying, evaluating and analyzing changes that could significantly impact the system of internal controls
Control Activities	Control activities are procedures established through policies and arrangements that help ensure the implementation of management directives to mitigate risks related to the achievement of the entity's goals	(10) Selection and development of control activities to mitigate risks (11) Selection and development of technology-dependent general control activities (12) Deployment of policies that define what is expected and procedures that implement them
Information and communication	It refers to the continuous and iterative process of providing, sharing and obtaining the necessary information. Communication is the means by which information is disseminated to all departments of the institution	(13) Obtaining and using relevant and credible information (14) Internal communication by disseminating information internally (15) External communication on matters affecting the conduct of internal control
Monitoring activities	Monitoring activities are carried out by either a continuous or discontinuous evaluation process, or a combination of them, to ensure that each of the five internal control components exists and works appropriately	(16) Conducting continuous or separate evaluations (17) Evaluating and communicating deficiencies of internal control

Source(s): COSO (2013)

Table 1.
Components and principles of COSO 2013 framework

(*maslahāh*) and preventing harm and difficulties (*māfsādāh* and *māshāqqāh*) to the public and the economy (Algabry *et al.*, 2020). In line with this, IIA in its standards has considered independence and objectivity as part of the internal auditors' framework. According to IIA (2017), independence means freedom from incidents that intimidate the ability of internal

audit activity in carrying out its obligation in an impartial manner. In contract, objectivity means the assessments and decisions of an auditor are not affected by any compulsion and remain neutral. It is in this regard that the internal Shari'ah auditor must confirm that his evaluation and judgement in arriving at a Shari'ah decision or advice is not affected by his other professional commitments and that it is free from any factors which may impair the exercise of his professional objectivity. As such, the internal Shari'ah auditor must put in place a vigorous methodology to perform his decision-making and be responsible for the quality and accuracy of his decisions or advice.

Professional proficiency: This is achieved by good recruiting practices, supervision of internal Shari'ah control, adherence to the code of ethics, proper knowledge, skills and discipline, continuous education and training and the necessary professional care (AAOIFI, 2015). Accordingly, internal Shari'ah auditors shall be competent and shall have appropriate educational background and training relevant to the fulfilment of their roles and responsibilities. They must also keep up to date with developments that may take place in the Islamic financial business.

As for the scope of work of internal Shari'ah audit, it shall comprise the examination of the adequacy and effectiveness of the IFI's system of internal Shari'ah control and the quality of performance in carrying out assigned responsibilities. More specifically, the roles of the internal Shari'ah auditor include the following (AAOIFI, 2015):

- (1) Planning each of the Shari'ah internal oversight tasks by collecting the information related to the activity to be monitored. Examples include:
 - Determining the objective and scope of internal Shari'ah control;
 - Obtaining all fatwas, guidelines and instructions of the SSB, the results of internal and external Shari'ah supervisory for the previous year and relevant correspondence, including correspondence with supervisory and oversight bodies;
 - Preparing the resources needed to carry out internal Shari'ah control;
 - Conducting a survey of the parts that must be stressed in the internal Shari'ah control, as appropriate, with a view to identifying activities, risks and parameters of control and inviting the monitored bodies to submit their observations and proposals;
 - Preparing internal Shari'ah supervision programs;
 - Determining the method and date for reporting the results of internal Shari'ah supervision;
 - Having the internal Shari'ah supervision action plan approved by the authorised entities, including the institution's SSB.
- (2) Examining and evaluating information related to internal Shari'ah supervision;
- (3) Attaching an objective report on the results of internal Shari'ah supervision;
- (4) In case measures have been decided upon, based on the final results of internal Shari'ah supervision, follow-up must be done to ensure they have been implemented. This is necessary to prevent the recurrence of cases of non-compliance with instructions.

BNM internal Shari'ah audit approach

BNM's SGF adopts a comprehensive approach to Shari'ah audit. Its definition of Shari'ah audit (BNM, 2019, p. 18) affirms that internal Shari'ah audit operates within a comprehensive approach and falls within the framework of Shari'ah supervision that aims to comply with the

provisions of Shari'ah and that it works in integration with Shari'ah risk management. BNM stresses that effective management of the risks of Shari'ah non-compliance relies heavily on:

a comprehensive and integrated approach to enterprise-wide risk management, which integrates risks arising from Shari'ah non-compliance alongside other risks such as credit, market, operational and liquidity; and the effective integration of control functions under Shari'ah governance and oversight arrangement of the risk management, compliance and internal audit at the entity-level and group-level (BNM, 2019, p. 16).

As part of the efforts for managing and controlling risk associated with Shari'ah non-compliance events, the SGF 2019 reinforces the internal control function for effective management of such risks. Unlike the SGF 2011 framework, which introduced Shari'ah research as an independent function, SGF 2019 assigns the research task to the secretariat of the Shari'ah committee. It is evident through the review of the updated SGF 2019 that the updated SGF seeks to integrate Shari'ah non-compliance risk matters with enterprise-wide risk management. This entails the IFI considering Shari'ah non-compliance risk along with other risks such as market, credit, liquidity and operational. In addition, SGF 2019 moved further towards end-to-end Shari'ah compliance by stressing the importance of spreading Shari'ah-compliance culture within all aspects of the IFI. This involves embracing an appropriate "tone from the top" for the sake of communicating the importance of adherence to Shari'ah requirements with all organisational levels. The updated SGF 2019 has also introduced and discussed in detail guidelines related to transparency and disclosure. Accordingly, the IFI will be required to present information about Shari'ah governance, policies and practices in the annual report on its website. The report should also include the Shari'ah committee's decision on the extent to which the IFI complies with Shari'ah rules and principles. The disclosure requirements are applicable even for an IFI operating as an Islamic window. As a result, it is expected that the new SGF 2019 will further enhance the oversight responsibility of the BOD and all other key organs concerned in the implementation of Shari'ah governance.

In view of the above, the internal Shari'ah audit is closely related to the topic of risk management. They are the two main components of compliance with Islamic law and the key defense lines to ensure the safety of the institution. Risk management represents the second line of defense to control Shari'ah risks while Shari'ah audit represents the third line of defense to identify errors and Shari'ah violations that occurred in the institution and to take corrective action and avoid their recurrence. According to BNM (2019, p. 16), Shari'ah risk management is: "a function that systematically identifies, measures, monitors and reports Shari'ah non-compliance risks to prevent any Shari'ah non-compliances". This systematic way of controlling the risks arising from non-compliance with the Shari'ah makes the institution able to continue its operations without exposing it to undesirable levels of risk. BNM (2019) further explained: "Shari'ah risk control and management must be part of an integrated framework for risk management in the organisation." Also, given the professionalism and sophistication of risk management in Shari'ah matters, this job should be done by risk management personnel who have appropriate qualifications and knowledge in risk management, as mentioned in BNM's SGF (BNM, 2019, p. 17).

Although some opinions discuss the Shari'ah risks that the institution must manage as if they are a separate category of risks, they actually enter into all of the financial institution's activities. They include: product or model risks, marketing and distribution risks, organisational risks, investment risks, human resource risks, operational risks and financial reporting risks. All of these categories entail risks of violating the Shari'ah and, of course, other risks as well.

With regard to the relationship between Shari'ah audit and Shari'ah risk management, many modern approaches to internal audit are risk-based. It represents a set of procedures

followed by the Internal Audit Department to direct audit efforts towards the riskiest areas of the organisation, whether at the level of work centers such as departments, divisions and subsidiaries or at the level of activities within individual work centers. The same applies to risk-based Shari'ah audit, as it is a methodology that links Shari'ah audit to the comprehensive framework of Shari'ah risk management in the organisation to provide a guarantee to the BOD that Shari'ah risk management processes are being effectively managed.

The extent to which the COSO methodology can be applied to internal Shari'ah audit

Before examining the possibility of applying the COSO methodology to the internal Shari'ah audit function, it is worth noting that although its developers assert that it represents a step forward for effective auditing, they have not claimed it to be the last word in this discipline or that it stands in no need of further amendments. It should also be noted that the framework was developed in response to the huge changes in the landscape of institutional operations, which have necessitated the development of a comprehensive and forward-looking methodology that is able to address these new challenges. As such, applying the COSO methodology to the internal Shari'ah audit process is, in our view, not only possible but desirable.

To illustrate, in the modern era, early attempts at adopting the best practices of conventional works appeared in the contemporary Muslim scholars' efforts to harmonise Islamic law with conventional law. The efforts of [Al-Sanhuri \(1952\)](#), [Al-Zarqā \(2021\)](#) and others were considered among the most advanced examples. However, as far as internal control is concerned, AAOIFI has responded to the existing approaches to governance and internal control in international financial practices. The recent call to adopt COSO in Shari'ah internal control is a clear endorsement of such a move ([AAOIFI, 2019](#)). Besides AAOIFI, the IFSB adopted the same approach with regard to benefitting from best practices in coming up with their standards. This approach was explicitly mentioned in the objectives of the IFSB, in which it is stated: "The work of the IFSB complements that of the Basel Committee on Banking Supervision, International Organisation of Securities Commissions and the International Association of Insurance Supervisors" ([IFSB, 2020](#)). With regard to local initiatives, BNM has made an advanced effort in this respect. The establishment of "The Law Harmonisation Committee" is considered part of Malaysia's continuous efforts to strengthen the legal system and infrastructure to cater for the growing development of Islamic finance. In the same way, BNM has issued its revised SGF for IFIs to accommodate the latest policy developments related to compliance, internal control and risk management ([BNM, 2019](#)).

These regulatory and supporting bodies, with the guidance of their renowned Shari'ah committee members, see advanced practices related to internal control as a technical approach to ensuring quality and effectiveness and do not consider their adoption to be a violation of the rules of Shari'ah. A fundamental principle of Shari'ah is that anything related to means that leads to enhanced efficiency in discharging one's responsibility without contravening a clear Shari'ah ruling is permissible. Likewise, custom and established practices are fundamental principles in Islamic law, comprising a class of evidence that is given consideration as long as it is not in conflict with the Shari'ah. In support of this point, the Islamic Fiqh Academy and AAOIFI allow the employment of certain customs and practices initiated for unlawful purposes as long as the way they are used does not violate the Shari'ah. The clearest example of this is the adoption of LIBOR (a reference price based on usury) as a reference price for measuring profits in IFIs. Similarly, the Shari'ah Advisory Council (SAC) of BNM in its 210th meeting, dated 23 December 2020, ruled that it is permissible to adopt Risk-Free Rates (RFR) that depart from LIBOR but are based on

compounding methodology which applies the same approach of compounding interest. They justify the permissibility on the basis that “the compounding methodology is merely an arithmetic method in determining the term rate that does not affect compliance of the transactions with Shari’ah requirements” (BNM, 2021).

Besides customs and practices, public interest (*maṣlahāh*), especially in its contemporary applications, requires the implementation of the best discoveries of management sciences, especially in light of the weakness of governance and audit in the practice of many IFIs. *Maṣlahāh* is given consideration by Shari’ah; in fact, it is the essence of *maqāṣid al-Shari’ah*. The Shari’ah aims to realise the interests of humanity and repel harm from them. Furthermore, *maqāṣid al-Shari’ah* recommends putting to good use the best achievements of the human mind in developing methods and tools for optimum performance. This *maqāṣidi* alignment is founded in texts of the Qur’an recommending what is good and prohibiting what is evil regardless of its source. The Prophet’s (SAW) ratification of some pre-Islamic practices such as forward sale (*salam*) is a clear example of such adoption. Although he (SAW) made some modifications related to specifying the volume, weight and delivery date of *salam*, he accepted it in principle (Bukhari, 1422H).

In addition to the *maqāṣidi* considerations, the COSO framework embodies a comprehensive approach that encompasses all aspects of internal control and integrates the institution’s activities in carrying out the tasks of auditing and risk management and these aspects are crucial to the success of the internal Shari’ah control. It also emphasises the overall approach of the institution in carrying out all the tasks and overlaps between the tasks of the institution. An example of this approach is risk management, which is considered an integral part of the decision-making process in all activities of existing IFIs. The framework eschews literal-minded formality in applying the principles of oversight. It goes beyond inflexible adherence to policies and procedures in favor of the auditors exercising discretionary diligence, provided they commit themselves to high professional competence and integrity. That is because an effective internal control system is not simply a matter of strict adherence to policies and procedures; rather, it goes beyond that to the exercise of judgement and discretion. That is a relative matter that requires competence on the part of those carrying out the work.

The framework also places the highest priority on risk management in that it makes it an integral part of the decision-making process in all of the institution’s activities and it is considered crucial for achieving goals and improving performance. Risk management in IFIs is considered the cornerstone for ensuring effective management of the institutions’ assets and general compliance with the Shari’ah rules and principles. In fact, the COSO control framework provides an integrated, systematic presentation of internal control and it lays down steps that can be easily applied to the Shari’ah audit of IFIs. It starts with the comprehensive elements of control and then frames them in organizing principles. It then adds 87 focus points, with the aim of making the work of the supervisors precise. For example, in the context of auditing the element of the “control environment”, it addresses the necessity of manifesting the principle of commitment to integrity and ethical values in the institution. Then it mentions the focus points in auditing this principle. These include establishing the principle of the role model (setting the tone at the top), defining standards of behavior, evaluating compliance with the standards of behavior and addressing deviations in a timely manner.

Notwithstanding the above justification to consider the COSO internal control framework, it remains to warn that it should not be slavishly and uncritically followed. That is because COSO’s internal control framework came in response to developments that had occurred in the system of governance, conditions of quality and technological progress. Although it is in principle applicable to all institutions, whether financial or economic or service providers, not all the details are binding on institutions that lack the complexities of modern organisations, or that have not undergone all the phases of their developments, or that have their own peculiarities.

Conclusion and recommendations

After examining the extent to which COSO can be incorporated in the Shari'ah-compliance function of IFIs, the authors have arrived at a number of conclusions. In general, the research found that IFIs are required to have a solid SGF in order to strengthen their Shari'ah-compliance mechanism and ensure that all relevant IFI regulations comply with Shari'ah rules and principles. Effective implementation of the Shari'ah-compliance function will further promote stakeholder confidence, as well as the integrity of the IFIs, by reducing Shari'ah non-compliance risks. Besides that, Shari'ah audit as an important part of governance represents one of the management functions aimed at ensuring the achievement of approved goals and reducing risks that an organisation may face. Likewise, internal Shari'ah oversight is a crucial part of the governance of IFIs that aims to ensure that the transactions undertaken by the institution are in compliance with the provisions of Shari'ah.

The adoption of the COSO methodology in the internal Shari'ah audit process, as suggested by AAOIFI and deliberated in this research, is not only possible but desirable. This is because the existing frameworks of Shari'ah supervision, whether AAOIFI's or the BNM's, though benefiting to some extent from the COSO framework, need to be further enhanced by widening the incorporation of the COSO methodology. In addition, the COSO framework places the highest priority on risk management in that it makes it an integral part of the decision-making process in all the institution's activities. This is in line with the basis of Islamic finance, which considers risk management as the cornerstone for ensuring end-to-end Shari'ah compliance. As a result, incorporating the comprehensive COSO risk management structure within the Shari'ah-compliance function will enhance IFIs' risk management and compliance.

The study also found that the COSO control framework provides an integrated, systematic presentation of internal control and that it lays down steps that can be easily applied to the Shari'ah audit of IFIs. Indeed, its overall objective is to provide reasonable assurance regarding the achievement of the institution's goals at the following levels: the effectiveness and efficiency of operational processes, the reliability of financial reports and compliance with laws and regulations.

In addition, the study has shown that there is a need to conduct further research to compare the COSO framework with that of AAOIFI and BNM to examine whether there are any contradictions between them. Further research is also needed to better examine the components of the COSO framework and explore the ways that it could be integrated and harmonised within the Shari'ah-compliance function of IFIs.

References

- AAOIFI (2004), *Accounting, Auditing and Governance Standards for Islamic Financial Institutions (Arabic Version)*, Accounting and Auditing Organization for Islamic Financial Institutions, Manama.
- AAOIFI (2007), *Shari'ah Standards for Islamic Financial Institutions (Arabic Version)*, Accounting and Auditing Organization for Islamic Financial Institutions, Manama, Bahrain.
- AAOIFI (2015), *Shari'ah Standards for Islamic Financial Institutions (English Version)*, Accounting and Auditing Organization for Islamic Financial Institutions, Manama.
- AAOIFI (2018), "Exposure draft of the governance standard for Islamic financial institutions: waqf governance", available at: <http://aaoifi.com/wp-content/uploads/2019/03/Waqf-Governance-Exposure-Draft-v-8.4-Final-for-Publishing-.pdf> (accessed 3 August 2020).
- AAOIFI (2019), "Governance standard for Islamic financial institutions (GSIFI) No. 9 'Shari'ah compliance function'", available at: <http://aaoifi.com/gsifi-9-Shari'ah-compliance-function/?lang=en> (accessed 3 May 2019).

- Abd Rahman, N., Mastuki, N., Kasim, N. and Osman, M.R. (2018), "Risk based internal Shari'ah audit practices in the Islamic bank", *The Journal of Social Sciences Research*, Vol. 5, pp. 954-961, Special Issue.
- Aden Abdi, A. (2017), "Applicability of COSO internal control framework on Islamic financial transactions. Case study: *murabaha* transaction", Master's thesis, The International Centre for Education in Islamic Finance (INCEIF), Kuala Lumpur.
- Alamgir, M. (2007), "Corporate governance: a risk perspective", *Paper Presented at Conference on Corporate Governance and Reform: Paving the Way to Financial Stability and Development*, Egyptian Banking Institute, Cairo.
- Algabry, L., Alhabshi, S.M., Soualhi, Y. and Alaeddin, O. (2020), "Conceptual framework of internal Shari'ah audit effectiveness factors in Islamic banks", *ISRA International Journal of Islamic Finance*, Vol. 12 No. 2, pp. 171-193.
- Al-Obaid, Y.J. (2017), "Legislative, financial and administrative framework", *Paper Presented at the Governance Conference in the State of Kuwait*, 10–11 October.
- Al-Sanhuri, A.al-R. (1952), "Al-Wasit li Sharh al-Qanun al-Madani al-Jadid", Middle Commentary on the New Civil Code, 10 parts in 12 volumes, Cairo (1952–1970).
- Al-Zarqā, M.A. (2021), *An Introduction to the General Theory of Obligations in Islamic Jurisprudence: A Thorough Formulation of the Theory's Texts*, (International Shari'ah Research Academy for Islamic Finance, Trans.), ISRA RMC, Kuala Lumpur.
- BNM (2019), "Shariah governance", available at: <https://www.bnm.gov.my/documents/20124/761679/Shariah+Governance+Policy+Document+2019.pdf> (accessed 11 April 2022).
- BNM (2021), "Ruling of the bank's Shariah Advisory Council on the adoption of risk-free rate", available at: <https://www.bnm.gov.my/-/sac-bnm-210th-meeting> (accessed 11 April 2022).
- Briciu, S., Dănescu, A.C., Dănescu, T. and Prozan, M. (2014), "A comparative study of well-established internal control models", *Procedia Economics and Finance*, Vol. 15, pp. 1015-1020, doi: [10.1016/S2212-5671\(14\)00662-5](https://doi.org/10.1016/S2212-5671(14)00662-5).
- Bukhari, M.B.I. (1422H), *Sahih Al-Bukhari*, Dar Tauq al-Nijat, Beirut.
- CIBAFI (2017), "CIBAFI comments on the AAOIFI exposure draft on governance standard No. 9 Shari'ah compliance function", The General Council for Islamic Banks and Financial Institutions, available at: https://cibafi.org/Files/LI/Content/CI1661-CIBAFICommentsontheAAOIFIDonStandardNo.9_.pdf (accessed 13 August 2020).
- COSO (2013), "Internal control, integrated framework: executive summary", The Committee of Sponsoring Organizations of the Treadway Commission, available at: <https://www.coso.org/Documents/990025P-Executive-Summary-final-may20.pdf> (accessed 8 April 2019).
- COSO (2017), "Enterprise risk management integrating with strategy and performance", available at: <https://www.coso.org/Documents/2017-COSO-ERM-Integrating-with-Strategy-and-Performance-Executive-Summary.pdf> (accessed 10 April 2019).
- Deloitte (2014), "Implementing the updated 2013 COSO framework: takeaways for banking and capital markets firms", available at: <https://www2.deloitte.com/content/dam/Deloitte/us/Documents/financial-services/us-fsi-cosoframework2013-032414.pdf> (accessed 30 April 2022).
- Hidayah, N. (2014), "Religious Compliance in Islamic Financial Institutions", Doctoral Dissertation, Aston University.
- IFSB (2009), *Guiding Principles on Shari'ah Governance Systems for Institutions Offering Islamic Financial Services*, Islamic Financial Services Board, Kuala Lumpur.
- IFSB (2020), "Background", available at: <https://www.ifsb.org/background.php> (accessed 11 April 2022).
- IIA (2017), *International Standards for the Professional Practice of Internal Auditing*, The Institute of Internal Auditors Malaysia, Kuala Lumpur.

-
- Lawson, B.P., Muriel, L. and Sanders, P.R. (2017), "A survey on firms' implementation of COSO's 2013 internal control-integrated framework", *Research in Accounting Regulation*, Vol. 29 No. 1, pp. 30-43.
- Mashal, A. (2015), "The integrated framework for the governance of the Islamic financial industry", *Paper Presented at the 14th AAOIFI Conference on Shari'ah Boards for Islamic Financial Institutions*, Bahrain.
- National Bank of Egypt (2003), "The method for exercising good corporate governance in companies: corporate governance", *Economic Bulletin*, Vol. 56 No. 2, p. 7.
- Rezaee, Z. (1995), "What the COSO report means for internal auditors", *Managerial Auditing Journal*, Vol. 10 No. 6, pp. 5-9.
- Shafii, Z. and Salleh, S. (2010), "Enhancing governance, accountability and transparency in Islamic financial institutions: an examination into the audit of Shari'a internal control system", *Malaysian Accounting Review*, Vol. 9 No. 2, pp. 23-42.
- Shura (2019), "Final statement and recommendations of the 8th Shura Sharia Audit Conference", 6-8 October 2019, Grand Millennium Hotel, Muscat, Oman.
- Udeh, I. (2019), "Observed effectiveness of the COSO 2013 framework", *Journal of Accounting and Organizational Change*, Vol. 16 No. 1, pp. 31-45.
- Uwadiae, O. (2015), "COSO – an approach to internal control framework", available at: <https://www2.deloitte.com/ng/en/pages/audit/articles/financial-reporting/coso-an-approach-to-internal-control-framework.html> (accessed 6 April 2019).
- Yazkhiruni, Y., Nurmazilah, M. and Haslida, A.H. (2018), "A review of Shari'ah auditing practices in ensuring governance in Islamic financial institution (IFIs) – a preliminary study", *Advances in Social Sciences Research Journal*, Vol. 5 No. 7, pp. 196-210.
- Zakaria, N., Mohd Ariffin, N. and Zainal, H. (2019), "Internal Shari'ah audit effectiveness and its determinants: case of Islamic financial institutions in Malaysia", *Kyoto Bulletin of Islamic Area Studies*, Vol. 12 No. 1, pp. 8-28.

About the authors

Said Bouheraoua, PhD, is currently a Senior Researcher and Director of Research Development and Innovation Department at ISRA Research Management Centre (ISRA RMC) and a lecturer at INCEIF University, Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia.

Fares Djafri, PhD, is an Islamic finance Researcher at ISRA RMC, INCEIF University, Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia. He is an AAOIFI-Certified Shariah Advisor and Auditor (CSAA). He has published many chapters in books and several articles in the area of Islamic finance, takāful, Islamic banking regulations, and Shari'ah governance. Fares Djafri is the corresponding author and can be contacted at: fares-isra@inceif.org, djafirifares@gmail.com

For instructions on how to order reprints of this article, please visit our website:

www.emeraldgrouppublishing.com/licensing/reprints.htm

Or contact us for further details: permissions@emeraldinsight.com